



Ally Petrillo

Associate

ally.petrillo@icemiller.com

614 462 1116

As an attorney in Ice Miller's Litigation Group, Ally Petrillo centers her practice on complex litigation and construction disputes, though her background includes a wide array of general litigation matters, including contract disputes, business litigation, insurance and bad-faith defense, and business, personal, and professional torts.

Ally works closely with clients to provide strategic legal counsel in order to effectively achieve her client's goals. She has helped individuals, small businesses, and large corporate clients navigate litigation at every stage of the process, including pre-suit investigations, filing or responding to initial pleadings, discovery, motion practice, alternative dispute resolution, and through trial. Ally's experience gives her a perspective and depth of knowledge that makes her a critical member of any client team.

Education

- The Ohio State University (B.A., 2013)
 - Major - Journalism
 - Minor - Political Science
- Capital University Law School (J.D., *summa cum laude*, 2017)

Admissions

- Ohio
- United States District Court - Southern District of Ohio
- United States District Court - Northern District of Ohio
- United States District Court - Western District of Michigan

Awards & Honors

- Ohio *Super Lawyers Rising Stars*®, 2024-2026
- *The Best Lawyers in America: Ones to Watch*®: Commercial Litigation, 2025-2026; Criminal Defense: White-Collar, 2026

Services & Industries

- Litigation
- Construction
- Commercial Litigation
- Class Actions
- Insurance Coverage & Recovery

Key Matters

- Represented a general contractor in a dispute with an owner on a multi-billion dollar construction project in Central Ohio.
- Representing a general contractor in a dispute with a joint venture partner on a hospital construction project in Central Ohio.
- Assisting in the representation of an owner in a dispute against an engineer in a multi-million dollar international arbitration.
- Defended an owner against mechanics liens filed on an assisted living facilities projects in Indiana and Kentucky and foreclosure actions related to those liens.
- Assisted in the representation of a subcontractor on a public works project in Eastern Pennsylvania.
- Representing a general contractor in a million dollar residential build dispute and arbitration against the homeowner.
- Representing a developer in construction arbitration and subsequent litigation.

Success Stories

Ice Miller Wins Ohio Supreme Court Ruling Upholding Arbitration in Bad Faith Insurance Case

Ice Miller LLP secured a key victory for its client, The Doctors Company Risk Retention Group (TDCRRG), when the Ohio Supreme Court issued a pivotal decision in *U.S. Acute Care Solutions, L.L.C. v. Doctors Co. Risk Retention Group Ins. Co.* The Court reinforced the enforceability of arbitration clauses in insurance contracts – even in tort claims alleging bad-faith insurance handling.

The dispute arose after U.S. Acute Care Solutions (USACS) self-funded a settlement in a Connecticut medical malpractice case and subsequently sued TDCRRG in Ohio, alleging bad faith claim handling. Although the Fifth District Court of Appeals ruled that the bad-faith claim was not subject to arbitration, the Ohio Supreme Court unanimously reversed that decision, holding that the arbitration clause in the insurance policy was broad enough to cover the dispute.

In its opinion, the Court emphasized Ohio's strong public policy favoring arbitration and clarified that broad arbitration clauses – like the one in TDCRRG's policy – are presumed to apply to a wide range of disputes, including tort claims. The Court found that the clause, which required arbitration of "any dispute relating to this policy," clearly covered the bad-faith claim, especially since the dispute could not be pursued without reference to the underlying insurance policy or the insurer-insured relationship.

The Court also addressed and distinguished its prior decision in *Scott Fetzer Co. v. Am. Home Assur. Co.*, which the Fifth Circuit relied upon in its decision below, explaining that while bad-faith claims are torts arising by the operation of law, they are not categorically excluded from arbitration. What matters, the Court explained, is the language of the arbitration clause and the parties' intent – and in this case, both support arbitration.

This ruling provides clarity and reassurance to insurers and policyholders alike: When parties agree to broad arbitration provisions, in Ohio, those agreements will be enforced, even against creatively pleaded tort claims. It also underscores the importance of precise contract drafting and the continuing strength of arbitration as a dispute resolution mechanism in Ohio.

Ice Miller LLP proudly represented the appellee in this appeal, with partner [Aneca Lasley](#) and senior counsel [Jenny Buchheit](#) leading the litigation team, supported by associates [Ally Petrillo](#) and [Abby DeMare](#). Their advocacy helped secure a decision that sets a meaningful precedent for future insurance disputes.